CITY OF DOVER HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
AGENDA
THURSDAY, July 21, 2016 - 3:00 P.M.
City Hall – Conference Room

ROLL CALL

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MEETING on May 19, 2016

COMMUNICATIONS & REPORTS

1. Summary of 2016 Activity
    a. Summary of Applications 2015 and 2016
    b. Summary of Architectural Review Certifications for 2016

2. Department of Planning & Inspections Update

NEW BUSINESS

1. Review of Permits Referred to Commission

NEW APPLICATIONS

1. HI-16-05 Mixed Use Buildings at 126 West Loockerman Street – Public Hearing and Review for Recommendation on the Architectural Review Certification associated with the construction of two mixed use buildings on the existing site known as Loockerman Way. One four-story building and one three-story building is proposed, with ground floor commercial uses and residential uses on upper floors, and associated site improvements, subject to future Site Development Plan approval processes. The property is zoned C-2 (Central Commercial Zone) and is subject to the H (Historic District Overlay Zone). The property is located on the south side of West Loockerman Street between South Governors Avenue and South State Street. The owner of record is Downtown Dover Partnership Corporation and equitable owner is Loockerman Plaza, LLC. Address: 126 West Loockerman Street. Tax Parcel: ED-05-077.09-04-06.00-000. Council District 4.

OLD BUSINESS

1. Certified Local Government (CLG) Program –
    a. Update on Grant Funding for FFY2016

ADJOURN

THE AGENDA ITEMS MAY NOT BE CONSIDERED IN SEQUENCE. THIS AGENDA IS SUBJECT TO CHANGE TO INCLUDE THE ADDITION OR THE DELETION OF ITEMS, INCLUDING EXECUTIVE SESSION.

Agenda Posted: July 12, 2016

CITY OF DOVER
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
May 19, 2016

The Regular Meeting of the City of Dover Historic District Commission was held on Thursday, May 19, 2016 at 3:00 PM with Chairman Salkin presiding. Members present were Chairman Salkin, Mr. McDaniel and Ms. Horsey. Mr. Jackson and Mr. Scrafford were absent.

Planning Office Staff members present were Mrs. Melson-Williams, Mr. Cook, and Mrs. Purnell.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The agenda was approved by acclamation. Mr. Jackson and Mr. Scrafford were absent.

ADOPTION OF MINUTES OF THE REGULAR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING OF April 21, 2016

Mr. McDaniel moved to adopt the minutes of the regular Historic District Commission meeting of April 21, 2016, seconded by Ms. Horsey and the motion was unanimously carried 3-0 of the members present. Mr. Jackson and Mr. Scrafford were absent.

COMMUNICATIONS & REPORTS

Summary of 2016 Activity

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that included in the packet was a Summary of the 2015 and 2016 applications that came before the Historic District Commission. Today the Historic District Commission will consider application HI-16-04 for a referral of a Sign Permit. There were a total of eight (8) applications in 2015.

Summary of Architectural Review Certifications for 2016

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that to date there has been seventeen (17) Permits with activities in the Historic District that includes building interior and exterior projects, roof, signage, and fence Permits. Eight (8) of the Permits were approved by Staff including four (4) that were heard by the Historic District Commission. There were five (5) Permits that involved interior items that were not visible from the public street which required no Architectural Review.

Department of Planning & Inspections Update

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that tentatively scheduled for June there will be a Delaware Plan for Health Charrette. This is a grant project that the Delaware Chapter of the American Planning Association received with other partners in the State. More information will be provided as it comes available.

NEW BUSINESS

Review of Permits Referred to Commission

HI-16-04 Sign Permit #16-611: Signage for The Depot at 595 Forest Street– Referral by the City Planner to the Historic District Commission for Review of Architectural Review Certification for Sign Permit application #16-611 for a wall sign including LED electronic message center. The property is zoned C-2A (Limited Central Commercial Zone) and is subject to the H (Historic District Zone). The property is located on the north side of Forest Street between South West Street and South Kirkwood Street. The owner of record

is the Lakshya, LLC. Addresses: 585-595 Forest Street and 111 S. West Street. Tax Parcel: ED-05-076.12-02-46.00-000.

Mrs. Melson-Williams gave a brief overview of the application and Staff Findings. The property previously appeared before the Historic District Commission on two (2) occasions related to signage in February 2000 and May 2008.

Chairman Salkin questioned if there were any questions.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question regarding if the *Zoning Ordinance* includes sign illumination and if the Commission should be considering anything else other that what is already covered by the zoning requirements, Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that the zoning requirements has illumination standards for signage. With the electronic message signs some of the level depends on what is on the screen.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question whether there was anything regarding this project that the Commission should be concerned about or does Code and zoning address all of the concerns, Mrs. Melson-William stated that there is a maximum level of illumination that is currently described in the Code.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question regarding the electronic message center duration of the message before it changes to a new message (timing of message), and if there were any other standards that have been used elsewhere in the City in order to give them guidance, Mr. Cook stated that it is in the Sign Ordinance with regards to change (the transitions) and there are generally code enforcement issues. The regulation is a one second transition and an eight second hold. There are limits on the different types of movements such as (phase or scroll). There are specific provisions related to depiction of movement. It should not approach animation.

Mr. McDaniel referred to the Dover Downs sign as a comparable sign.

Mr. Cook stated that the Dover Downs sign is probably not typical due to the size, but a more typical one would be some of the smaller businesses (Modern Maturity Center, Drugstores).

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that it is part of the standard regulations and one of the Staff Findings is to look at the duration that the message stays. The code minimum is eight (8) seconds, because it is in the Historic District and if you wanted it to appear more like a static sign you might suggest the message stay longer than eight (8) seconds. There is no specific recommendation.

Responding to Ms. Horsey's question regarding whether the speed limit was 25mph and if you could read the message board in eight (8) seconds and if you would be able to read it more than once, Mrs. Melson-Williams replied that it is probably 25mph.

Ms. Patel stated that the sign is for persons (customers) pumping gas. Customers that are in the parking lot and to attract more customers.

Representative: Ms. Jaimini Patel and Mr. Jay Patel; Owners

Ms. Patel stated that the electronic message center was mainly for customers in the parking lot. They would be very appreciative if this would be approved. For the last six (6) months, they have been suffering from competition of other businesses.

Chairman Salkin questioned if there were any additional questions.

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that the application did not require a public hearing. Staff felt that it was a type of permit that the Historic District Commission should review as the electronic message center is a new concept in the Historic District. It was brought to the Historic District Commission for guidance and afterwards Staff will complete approval of the Sign Permit application.

Mr. McDaniel moved to accept Staff Recommendations for application HI-16-04 to allow for the standard timing on the LED electronic message center. The motion was seconded by Ms. Horsey and unanimously carried 3-0. Mr. Jackson and Mr. Scrafford were absent.

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that the message will be governed by what is already existing in the *Zoning Ordinance.*

NEW APPLICATIONS
There were none.

OLD BUSINESS
Certified Local Government (CLG) Program: Update on Application for Grant Funding for FFY2016
Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that the application for Grant Funding for FFY 2016 was submitted. Included in the member packet was a copy of the cover letter submission and the narrative of specific project. Staff was notified that the application was received and the next step is a formal letter of agreement relating to the grant. The grant award is $10, 332 and the City has to provide a minimum cash or in kind match of $6,822 which is 40% of the total project cost. The Planning Office had requested $10,000 in consulting services which would cover the match. It is a project to evaluate and update the *Design Standards and Guidelines* document which dates from 1992. With the project they will be looking to have consulting services assistance. The updates to the *Design Standards and Guidelines* is something that was identified in the City's Comprehensive Plan. They plan to have a consultant on board by the fall and have a draft document by the spring of 2017. They do not need to have the document totally through the entire review process, adopted, and in place by the end of June 2017, but they would like to continue to move in that direction.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question whether it would be roughly a $20,000 project for consulting services and if the City does not come through do you figure out the alternative, Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that we will figure out an alternative and if does not stay at $10,000 and becomes a lesser number. It may have to switch to cash and in kind which would mean specific staff hours dedicated to the project to match the grant.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question regarding the City Council Budget schedule, Mrs. Melson-Williams replied that they are posted, she thinks they begin hearing presentations next week; she was not sure of the day.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question whether there would be a specific time the project would be heard, Mrs. Melson-Williams replied that this is a line item in the Planning Office Budget.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question whether it was the City Manager's recommended budget, Mrs. Melson-Williams replied yes.

Responding to Chairman Salkin's question whether it would be helpful for them individually or as a group to endorse the line item or will it draw attention, Mrs. Melson-Williams replied that it might draw attention, but she was not sure. Some years they delved into individual budget lines and sometimes they do not. The entire budget document is roughly 300 pages. This would be considered as part of the General Fund regarding the scheduling. She will let Mrs. Townshend know of what has been requested regarding the guidance and schedule of the budget meetings.

Responding to Ms. Horsey's question regarding the groups, Mrs. Melson-Williams replied that she would think that they would be looking for that kind of stakeholder input. A lot of it will go into the project planning phase on how to involve other entities that have a preservation interest.

Mr. McDaniel stated that the Dover Century Club brick work and gutter is being done by Paul's Pointing.

Mr. McDaniel also shared information regarding the $1200 fee for a variance application in Lewes compared to the fee charges in the City of Dover. The fee is nonrefundable. They have a beautiful Historic District.

Mrs. Melson-Williams stated that if it is an application for example new construction then the application fee is $250 for Architectural Review Certification. For Sign Permits referred to the Historic District Commission there is not an additional fee. The Sign Permit is S0.75 per square foot, but with a minimum of $25.00. A lot of the smaller jurisdictions fees are higher than the City of Dover because a lot of their technical review is done by hired consultants not professional staff.

The meeting was adjourned by acclamation.

Meeting adjourned at 3:40 PM

Sincerely,

Maretta Savage-Purnell
Secretary

City of Dover Historic District Commission
Summary of Applications 2016
Updated thru July 13, 2016

FILE#	PLAN NAME	LOCATION	TYPE	ACTION	STATUS
HI-16-01	Capitol Complex Lighting Upgrades	Capital Complex Area: Federal Street, Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, Legislative Avenue	Presentation of Information	Presentation at HDC 2/18/2016 Meeting	Project lighting concept for light fixture and bulb illumination positively received by HDC. Project is informational only; no formal action or permitting process required.
HI-16-02	Carriage House at 2 Kings Highway NE	2 Kings Highway NE	Demolition of garage and construction of carriage house building as accessory structure	Architectural Review Certification granted with conditions at 4/21/2016 HDC Meeting; Staff Approval of Permit per ARC pending	Upon receipt of Building Permit #16-337 project was identified as requiring application to HDC; Application HI-16-02 filed and considered; Permit approved (but not issued as of yet)
HI-16-03	CLG Grant Application for FFY2016	Certified Local Government Application for Grant Funding	Information File	Notice of Eligibility for Grant 2/19/2016; FFY2016 CLG Grant Application submitted 4/28/2016 to SHPO	Grant Application received; Formal Award Letter received and Letter of Agreement pending; Grant Timeframe 7/1/16-6/30/17
HI-16-04	Referral of Sign Permit #16-611	The Depot at 595 Forest Street	Sign Permit for Wall Sign with Electronic Message Center	Permit #16-611 referred to HDC by City Planner for Architectural Review Certification consultation; Considered at 5/19/16 HDC Meeting	Permit approved based on HCD consultation; Permit issued
HI-16-05	Mixed Use Buildings at Loockerman Way	126 West Loockerman Street, current site of Loockerman Way (plaza area)	3-story Commercial/Apartment Building and 4-story Commercial/Apartment Building	7/21/2016 Schedule for HDC Public Hearing and Review for Recommendations on ArchRevCert	Recommendations on ArchRevCert pending. Site Plan application to be filed for Planning Commission review.

City of Dover Historic District Commission
Summary of Applications 2015
Updated thru July 13, 2016

FILE#	PLAN NAME	LOCATION	TYPE	ACTION	STATUS
HI-15-01	DRAFT Certified Local Government Application	City of Dover	Application to be designated as a Certified Local Government	Draft Application presented to HDC on 1/15/2015. Draft Application reviewed by Legislative, Finance & Administration Committee on 2/9/2015. City Council on 2/23/2015 approved Application for submission.	Planning Staff completed DRAFT of CLG Application. Application presented to City Council who endorsed its submission. Submission to SHPO with cover letter dated 3/30/2015 from Mayor. Designated a CLG on May 15, 2015.
HI-15-02	Sign Permit #14-1609 Referral	151 Kings Highway SW, Woodburn Governors Mansion	Sign Permit for post and panel sign	Permit #14-1609 referred to HDC by City Planner for Architectural Review Certification consultation; 1/15/2015 HDC Meeting - approved ARC as submitted in permit; Staff Approval of Permit per ARC	Permit issued for post and panel sign. Sign installed.
HI-15-03	Sign Permit #15-15 Referral	6 South State Street, Baird Mandalas & Brockstedt	Sign Permit for freestanding sign and fence	Permit #15-15 referred to HDC by City Planner for Architectural Review Certification consultation; 1/15/2015 HDC Meeting - approved ARC with conditions on height and size; Staff Approval of Permit per ARC	Permit issued. Freestanding sign and fence installed at property corner of South State Street and Division Street.
HI-15-04	Building Permit #15-19 Referral	3 Loockerman Plaza, PNC Bank	Building Permit for Drive-thru ATM structure	Permit #15-19 referred to HDC by City Planner for Architectural Review Certification consultation; 1/15/2015 HDC Meeting - approved ARC with conditions for dumpster enclosure; Staff Approval of Permit per ARC	Permit issued. Construction complete.
HI-15-05	Biggs Museum Sculpture	406 Federal Street	Installation of exterior sculpture of tree and birds	Architectural Review Certification Application granted at HDC meeting of 2/19/2015; Staff Approval of Permit per ARC	Permit issued. Installation of the sculpture is complete.

City of Dover Historic District Commission
Summary of Applications 2015
Updated thru July 13, 2016

HI-15-06	Building at 312 West Loockerman Street	312 West Loockerman Street	Determination of Demolition by Neglect	Determination of Demolition by Neglect by HCD at meeting of 2/19/2015. Property declared a Dangerous Building by City Council on 3/9/2015.	Active Code Enforcement Cases and designated a Dangerous Building. Property owner has until 9/9/2015 to repair or demolish building. City taking action to demolish the building. Demolition Permit #15-1387 issued 10/9/2015. Demolition of building complete.
HI-15-07	Santa House Project	Loockerman Way and other locations	Informational Presentation	Project for a portable temporary structure. Presentation on project at 4/23/2015 HDC Meeting. Staff Approval of Permit #15-1159 per ARC recommendations.	Permit issued. Structure placed 12/17/2015.
HI-15-08	South Bradford Street Streetscape Enhancements Project	Bradford Street segment between West Division Street and West Loockerman Street	Informational Presentation	Project concept for proposed pedestrian improvements including new sidewalks, curb ramps, crosswalks, curbing, pedestrian lighting, landscaping. Presentation on project concept at 12/17/2015 HDC Meeting.	Presentation of project concepts/alternatives. Public Workshop held by DelDOT 1/12/2016. City Council granted authorization on 4/11/2016 to execute Transportation Enhancement Program Agreement to initiate the project design.

Summary of Permit Applications with Architectural Review Certification
2016 - Updated Thru 6-30-2016

DATE	PERMIT #	LOCATION	TYPE	ACTION ON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW CERTIFICATE	NOTES
1/12/2016	16-35	47 South West Street	Roof Permit	Staff Approval. No ArchRevCert required due to lack of visibility.	Replacement of flat roof system.
2/8/2016	16-64	151 South Governors Avenue, Inkredible Art	Sign Permit - Projecting Sign	Staff Approval.	Hanging sign under pent roof canopy.
2/4/2016	16-65	100 West Water Street	Building Permit - Roof Drainage system	Staff Approval. No ArchRevCert required due to lack of visibility.	Additional downspout drainage system connection on rear/interior parking lot side of building that is not visible.
2/10/2016	16-129	308 South State Street, Law Offices of Sean Lynn	Sign Permit - Projecting Sign	Staff Approval	Projecting sign hanging under pent roof awning. Sign installed.
2/18/2016	16-175	40 The Green, The Century Club	Building Permit - Gutters & Downspouts	Staff Approval. Project information update to HDC on 2/18/2016.	Replacement of gutters using metal half rounds and downspouts on sides of building. Limited visibility.
3/28/2016	15-1702	34 South State Street, Wesley College President's House	Administrative Building Permit	Staff Approval	Brick replacement of brick sidewalk in herringbone pattern along property frontage.
3/7/2016	16-112	150 South Governors Avenue	Building Permit - Exterior and Interior Renovations	Staff Approval with notations about selection of exterior finish materials and formats.	Interior Renovations to retail space. Exterior Renovations of door & window replacements, reclad in new vinyl siding with entire façade in horizontal siding of clapboard style product. Discussion at 2/18/2016 HDC meeting recommended evaluation of alternative finish materials. Project work underway.
3/11/2016	16-237	147 South New Street, Bait N Hook	Building Permit - Interior Renovations	Staff Approval. No ArchRevCert required for interior work.	Interior Renovation for take-out restaurant tenant.
3/18/2016	16-259	11 North State Street, Gunn Wealth Management	Sign Permit - Freestanding Sign	Staff Approval	Reface existing signage on decorative metal fence and wall sign on wall at rear entry for new tenant. Signs installed.

Summary of Permit Applications with Architectural Review Certification
2016 - Updated Thru 6-30-2016

DATE	PERMIT #	LOCATION	TYPE	ACTION ON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW CERTIFICATE	NOTES
3/21/2016	16-282	147 South New Street, Bait N Hook	Sign Permit - Wall Sign and Window Signs	Staff Approval	Wall sign to be mounted in signboard area of upper wall and placement of window signage.
3/21/2016	16-292	316 South Governors Avenue	Fence Permit	Staff Approval	Replacement of fence segment with decorative metal fencing.
3/29/2016	16-369	527-529 South State Street, Lands of Boyles	Fence Permit	HDC Recommendation on ARC 2/21/2013; PC Approval of ARC 3/18/2013; Applications HI-13-01 and S-13-03; Staff issued Permit	Construction of fence along Elm Terrace frontage as part of Parking Lot construction project.
3/29/2016	16-360	527-529 South State Street, Lands of Boyles	Administrative Building Permit - Parking Lot construction	HDC Recommendation on ARC 2/21/2013; PC Approval of ARC 3/18/2013; Applications HI-13-01 and S-13-03; Staff issued Permit	Construction of Parking lot at rear of property with access from alley.
4/1/2016	16-291	116 E Water Street	Fence Permit	Staff Approval	Fence along west side of rear parking lot. Portion of fence located within the Historic District is limited to 4 ft. height.
4/12/2016	16-417	5 E Reed Street, Weyant Hall Building	Roof Permit	No Planning Staff Review. No ArchRevCert required due to lack of visibility.	Replacement of flat roof system.
4/12/2016	16-442	213 West Loockerman Street, Janaids	Building Permit - Interior Renovations	Administrative Approval of Permit. (No ArchRev Cert required for interior work.)	Replaces previously issued Permit #14-1074 that had expired for interior renovations for change of use to hair salon.
4/28/2016	16-555	116 E Water Street, Barratt Business Services	Sign Permit	Staff Approval	Reface of existing post sign.
5/16/2016	16-25	40 The Green, The Century Club	Building Permit - Exterior Renovations	Staff Approval	Brick repair and repointing on front façade. Project complete.
5/10/2016	16-389	333 South Governors Avenue, Access Labor Services	Sign Permit - Window Signs	Staff Approval	Consultation with Staff to refine sign proposal for approval of a series of window signs.

Summary of Permit Applications with Architectural Review Certification
2016 - Updated Thru 6-30-2016

DATE	PERMIT #	LOCATION	TYPE	ACTION ON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW CERTIFICATE	NOTES
5/4/2016	16-400	102 South Governors Avenue	Roof Permit	Staff Approval	Replacement of existing asphalt shingle roof with new asphalt shingle roof
5/23/2016	16-666	54 South State Street, Presbyterian Church	Temporary Sign Permit	Staff Approval	Temporary Banner installation.
6/24/2016	16-755	211-213 West Loockerman Street, Janaids	Sign Permit - Window Signs	Staff Approval	Two window signs installed
6/20/2016	16-833	403-405 West Loockerman Street, Coaching Great Minds Preschool Academy	Sign Permit - Roof Sign	Staff Approval	Reface of existing roof sign

City of Dover

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT
Before Dover Historic District Commission
July 21, 2016

Application:	Mixed Use Buildings at 126 West Loockerman Street, HI-16-05
Project Location:	Loockerman Way located on the south side of West Loockerman Street between South Governors Avenue and South State Street
Property Address:	126 West Loockerman Street, Dover
Tax Parcel:	ED-05-077.09-04-06.00-000
Owner: Equitable Owner:	Downtown Dover Partnership Corporation Loockerman Plaza, LLC
Present Zoning:	C-2 (Central Commercial Zone) H (Historic District Zone)
Existing Use: Proposed Uses:	Park/Plaza Area and Parking Lot Two Mixed Use (Commercial & Apartments) Buildings

Project Description:
The Historic District Commission will conduct a Public Hearing and will act on a Recommendation to the City of Dover Planning Commission for an Architectural Review Certificate for the Mixed Use Buildings project at 126 West Loockerman Street. The project requires Site Plan review by the Planning Commission.

This application consists of a project involving the construction of two mixed use buildings on the existing park/plaza site known as Loockerman Way. One four-story building and one three-story building is proposed, with ground floor commercial uses and residential uses (apartments) on upper floors, and associated site improvements, subject to future Site Development Plan approval processes. The property is zoned C-2 (Central Commercial Zone) and is subject to the H (Historic District Overlay Zone). The property is located on the south side of West Loockerman Street between South Governors Avenue and South State Street and includes frontage on West North Street.

Previous Applications:
The subject areas of this proposed project site were involved in previous application appearing before the Historic District Commission. A summary list of these applications is provided below.

- HI-02-01 Demolition of 116 West Loockerman Street (Capitol Office Supply). Building demolished and area adjacent to Loockerman Street was landscaped with ornamental trees and shrubs with a fence. Application S-02-18 Collegian Hotel for construction of a six story mixed-use building (retail, offices, and hotel). Project expired.

- HI-06-05 Demolition of the buildings at 114, 126 and 128 West Loockerman Street (including old Dover Newsstand and Dover Hardware). Buildings were demolished in March –May 2007.
- HI-06-09 Collegian Complex for construction of a multi-story mixed –use (commercial and apartments) building fronting West Loockerman Street. Project expired.
- HI-11-05 North Street Area Improvement Project included the redevelopment this vacant area in the block between West North Street and West Loockerman Street as a plaza with parking lot. The space is known as Loockerman Way.

Property Information:
The project site is located with the local Historic District Zone (H) and subject to the provisions of the *Zoning Ordinance,* Article 3 §21 and referenced sections.

This area is located within the boundaries of a National Register Historic District, specifically the Victorian Dover Historic District. A series of late nineteenth and twentieth century commercial buildings which previously stood in this area are described in the building inventory listing found within the National Register nomination completed for the Victorian Dover Historic District (nomination completed 1977-78).

A series of historic maps was reviewed by Planning Staff for preliminary information on this block located between West Loockerman Street and North Street. The *1868 Beers Map* published by Pomeroy & Beers shows a limited number of buildings fronting on Loockerman Street; a more significant number of buildings are shown fronting directly on North Street. By 1885, the *1885 Bird's Eye View of Dover* shows multiple commercial buildings fronting the south side of Loockerman Street and the series of buildings fronting on North Street appear to be residential dwellings. Review of the series of *Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps* would show the changes overtime for these areas including the disappearance on the residential dwellings as the area redeveloped. For Dover, this series of maps dated from 1897-1944.

Area Studies
The overall project should strive to follow the design and planning strategies outlined in the *Dover Transit Center Neighborhood Plan and Design Book (January 14, 2011)* Basic design principles from the Plan include creating buildings that engage the street, parking at center of blocks, recognize history and character of existing architecture, creating streetscapes, and creating pocket parks and other public open spaces. In the discussion of Building Types, it states "Size, bulk and scale of new buildings should be generally compatible with adjacent structures and the architectural character of the surrounding neighborhood. However, some variety is encouraged as long as it does not overwhelm existing buildings." This subject project area is an infill site and was referred to as Loockerman Plaza in the *Neighborhood Plan* with a concept for buildings flanking a pedestrian plaza area.

PROJECT PROPOSAL (Drawings dated June 15, 2016 and Site Plan dated July 13, 2016):
The application proposes construction of two mixed-use buildings and site improvements. See descriptions below and submitted plans and drawings. The project is presented in a Site Plan, elevation drawings, floor plans, and color renderings. The elements of the project are as follows:

1) Existing Conditions: Loockerman Way Plaza & Parking Lot: The existing conditions of the property include a public plaza area with paving treatments (brick and concrete), lawn areas, tree plantings, and benches extending from West Loockerman Street to West North Street providing a mid-block pedestrian way. There is an existing parking lot with access from North Street. From the submission, it is unclear what portions of this existing plaza and parking lot will remain.

2) Mixed Use Buildings (West Building and East Building): The buildings are basically rectangular in footprint and the building massing/form presents some angled wall surfaces with projecting boxed windows and flat roof system. The west building is three story and the east building is four story. For both buildings, the predominant exterior finish is a type of masonry/brick (as depicted in the color renderings). The front façade on Loockerman Street and the elevations facing the interior plaza area consist of the commercial retail/restaurant areas on the first floor with large display windows in a glass storefront window system. The upper floors, where the apartments are to be located, have a spaced series tall two-part vertical windows. On the plaza elevations, the windows are placed in box-like elements that protrude at differing depths from the wall surface. There is a plain cornice detail at the roofline of the Loockerman Street facades.

3) Access/Parking: Two parking lot areas with separate direct accesses to West North Street are shown. The western parking lot appears to be making use of a portion of the existing parking lot. The parking lot show thirty-three (33) and twenty-five (25) parking spaces.

4) Landscaping: The Site Plan shows a series of trees on the site: a grouping of trees in planters in the public plaza area near Loockerman Street and other trees within small lawns areas and along the eastern edge of the west parking lot. A line of screening plantings is along the east property line.

5) Site Features: The proposed mixed-use buildings flank an area labeled as a public plaza of concrete with select areas of brick paver accents. Adjacent to the buildings table seating areas are shown on some drawings. A series of low masonry walls and raised planter boxes are in the plaza area.

Review of DESIGN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES

In the Historic District Zone, the uses and bulk requirements are governed by the provisions of the *Zoning Ordinance* related to the zoning of the property. In this case, these are the provisions of the C-2 zone (Article 3 §13 and Article 4 §4.14) and other supplementary regulations. The Historic District Commission can consider alternatives to the bulk requirements relating to building height, bulk, and setbacks as related to the Architectural Review Certification process. The proposal appears to comply with the bulk standards of the C-2 Zoning District including setbacks, number of stories/height, and Floor Area Ratio; an engineered Site Plan would confirm this.

The subject project site is located in the Dover Historic District Zone within the Loockerman Historic Context. The Loockerman Historic Context is described on pages 2-7 through 2-8. Location within the Dover Historic District Zone requires proposals for demolition, new

construction, additions, and certain renovation or rehabilitation activities to existing buildings to receive an Architectural Review Certificate.

As stated in the *Design Standards and Guidelines for the City of Dover Historic District Zone*, an Architectural Review Certificate will be granted "if it is found that the architectural style, general design, height, bulk and setbacks, arrangement location and materials affecting the exterior appearance are generally in harmony with neighboring structures and complementary to the traditional architectural standards of the historic district." In accordance with *Zoning Ordinance*, Article 10 §3.2, the Historic District Commission will take action to make a recommendation regarding the project's compliance with the architectural review standards.

This proposal should be reviewed for conformity with the design criteria and development guidelines found in the *Design Standards and Guidelines* of Chapter 4: New Construction, Additions, Demolition and Relocation. For the new mixed-use commercial/apartment buildings, the applicable review considerations are those associated with "New Construction" Information on the review considerations is given below.

<u>New Construction</u>
The *Design Standards and Guidelines* for New Construction (Chapter 4: pages 4-1 through 4-8) provide the design criteria and development guidelines. The guidelines specify the following individual considerations for new construction to be considered in the review by the Historic District Commission (and Planning Commission) of the project for Architectural Review Certification:

- Style
- Scale *(building to reflect dominant cornice and roof height of adjacent buildings)*
- Elevation of the First Floor
- Floor-to-Floor heights
- Bays, windows and doors *(size, relationship, spacing of)*
- Absolute Size *(compare overall size of new building)*
- Massing *(relationship of solid-to-void)*
- Orientation *(location of primary façade)*
- Proportions *(comparison of height to width of building and elements)*
- Materials
- Forms *(shape of building and roof to be complementary)*
- Siting *(location of building on lot and in relation to street)*
- High density/ large-scale construction

Also the sections of the *Design Guidelines* for Landscaping and Site Amenities, Paving and Bordering, and Parking Lots found on pages 3-24 through 3-25 and 3-27 must be considered. These guidelines highlight the consideration that should be given to the areas surrounding buildings including the choice of materials. It notes that parking lots are elements that are located within the historic district; however, the choice of materials and the introduction of landscaping can assist in mitigation of their impact. The *Design Guidelines* state that parking lots should be screened from the street and "their layout should include islands planted with trees to break-up expanses of paved areas." It also recommends that 20% of the parking lot should be unpaved and planted. (See DS&G page 3-27.)

STAFF COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The following are Staff comments and recommendations for this application regarding project activities and Architectural Review Certification.

1) Staff recommends approval of the Architectural Review Certificate for the two Mixed-Use Buildings (West & East Buildings) and associated site improvements based on the proposal presented in the application submission subject to the conditions and recommendations below. It is contemporary design of new buildings while maintaining a mid-block pedestrian/public space between the buildings. The buildings are sited to continue the established streetscape with the buildings at the edge of the wide sidewalk. The use of brick as the primary exterior finish material does fit the character of the Historic District. This recommendation is made subject to the following comments and suggested revisions.

2) Staff recommendations as conditions regarding the Architectural Review Certification of the proposed buildings. The following conditions are recommended by Staff to improve the project's compliance with the recommended guidelines of the *Design Standards & Guidelines*.
    a. While the East Building complies with the maximum number of stories and building height within the C-2 Zone, it is recommended that the absolute size and size of the building be evaluated further. Options to address these guidelines include: a vertical articulation (wall plane, material choice, etc.) to create an appearance of two buildings side-by-side; a setback or stepping back of the fourth floor, or other design options. These revisions may be necessary to respect the scale of buildings and the dominant cornice line (building heights) within this area of the Historic District.
    b. The current window format on the upper floors gives the appearance of vertical bands on the Loockerman Street frontage of both buildings. A balance of massing proportions between wall vs. window/solid vs. void would be improved by a larger wall surface at the transition between floors.
    c. The front facades facing Loockerman Street appear 'flat' and 'plain.' The addition of other fenestration elements in the masonry/brickwork size and coursing format, change in wall surface plane, additional detailing or trimwork as distinctions between floors and at the rooftop cornice line would add dimension to the elevation. Part of the character of the existing buildings in the Historic District is the uniqueness and specialized details found on the upper floor areas and at the roof cornice of buildings.
    d. Window glass must be clear glass; no tinted or reflective glass.
    e. Any revisions or changes in the identified materials or refinement of the building design may be subject to further review by the Historic District Commission.

3) Some of the building elements were not specifically described with the application information. Please provide information for consideration and discussion.
    a. Specific identification of all materials: type of masonry/brick, window surrounds and box-like window elements, cornice, glass wall system, balcony railings, etc.
    b. Identify material on sloped portions of wall/roof facing the interior plaza.

c. Identify roof drainage system (internal, gutters & downspouts, etc.
d. Location of mechanical equipment.

4) Staff recommendations as conditions regarding the Architectural Review Certification of the site improvements. The following conditions are recommended by Staff to improve project's compliance with the recommended guidelines of the *Design Standards and Guidelines*.
    a. The details and size of the proposed site elements/improvements are difficult to be determined from some of the drawings submitted. The formal Site Plan (received 7/15/2016) begins to clarify these items.
    b. Utilize brick as the construction material for any low walls and planters within the plaza areas as the use of exposed concrete masonry is discouraged in the Historic District.
    c. Continue to maintain street trees along the West Loockerman Street frontage of the property.
    d. Maintain and/or implement a series of street trees along the North Street frontage of the property (where separation distances can be met from utilities).
    e. Implement a landscaped screening of the parking lots from North Street through the planting of low growing shrubs. The *Zoning Ordinance* requires this screening specifically in areas where parking lots are located across from residential uses. This will also direct pedestrians to use of designated sidewalks and existing crosswalks in the area.
    f. Light fixtures/poles utilized along the streetscape should continue style of the lighting used in the Downtown Loockerman Street area. The acorn-style lighting is proposed by the applicant which is found in the Downtown.
    g. The acorn style light fixtures shall also continue to be utilized for the site lighting internal to the site in the public plaza area and the parking lot areas. This could include single fixture poles or poles with two light fixtures.
    h. Install several benches or other types of seating options within the plaza areas and install several trash cans on plaza site.
    i. Utilize black posts for signage elements including traffic control signs.

5) Some of the site improvements/amenities were not specifically described with the application information. Please provide information for consideration and discussion.
    a. Identify the location of the Code required bicycle parking spaces including the design/format of the parking rack system.
    b. Further clarify the materials for the landscaped and hardscaped areas of the plaza including surface pavements, planters, tree and shrub plantings, benches or other seating, bicycle parking racks, etc.
    c. Clarify the surface treatment of lawn areas, plantings, type of mulch, etc. on the site.
    d. Identify the location and format of Dumpsters.
    e. Identify the location of any outdoor based active recreation amenities.
    f. The plan provides limited information on the projects' strategy for stormwater management. This may impact the parking lot and landscaping designs.

g. All mechanical equipment should be located so as to not be visible from the streets. Appropriate screening by plantings, screening materials, etc. must be implemented.

6) The use of brick paving materials for sidewalk construction is a key feature found throughout the Historic District area. The City's standards for sidewalk format must be met including the installation of accessible ramps and removal of any unused curb cuts along the street frontages.

7) The proposed landscaping including tree plantings and landscape plantings should be completed with species appropriate to the site conditions of an urban area.

8) The applicant should be aware of the potential for historic archaeological resources which may include previous building locations, wells, privies, etc. on the property. The State Division of Historical & Cultural Affairs can provide technical assistance when dealing with found archaeological resources or previous studies at the subject location.

9) In the event, that major changes and revisions to the design, materials, or site layout occur with the project contact the Department of Planning and Inspections. These changes may require resubmittal for review by the Historic District Commission.

10) The plan for this project is also subject to the application and review process for Site Development Plan (Article 10 §2 of the *Zoning Ordinance*) before the Planning Commission. Note: Additional technical items for compliance with the *Zoning Ordinance* and other regulations may be identified during the Plan Review Process.

11) For building construction, the requirements of the building code and fire code must be complied with. Consult with the Chief Building Inspector and Office of the Fire Marshal for these requirements. The resolution of these items can impact the site design or the building exterior finishes or design in some instances.

12) The applicant shall be aware that Building Permits are required to proceed with any construction activities on the property. The permit applications must comply with the approvals and conditions granted through the Architectural Review Certification and Site Plan Review process.

13) The applicant shall be aware that a Sign Permit is required to proceed with the placement of signage on the property. Compliance with the sign regulations will be reviewed with the Sign Permit application. Any depiction of signage on these plans is considered conceptual and approval of the plans does not constitute approval of the signage.

<u>Historic District Commission Action Required</u>

The Historic District Commission shall consider the proposal and provide a recommendation to the Planning Commission in regards to the Architectural Review Certification for the project site development plan. The recommendation should reflect consideration of the *Design Standards and Guidelines.*